



Calhoun: The NPS Institutional Archive

Faculty and Researcher Publications

Faculty and Researcher Publications

2012

Train Station, The Five-Minute Analyst

Schramm, Harrison

Analytics-Magazine.org, www.informs.org, Analytics, September/October 2012

<http://hdl.handle.net/10945/40116>



Calhoun is a project of the Dudley Knox Library at NPS, furthering the precepts and goals of open government and government transparency. All information contained herein has been approved for release by the NPS Public Affairs Officer.

Dudley Knox Library / Naval Postgraduate School
411 Dyer Road / 1 University Circle
Monterey, California USA 93943

<http://www.nps.edu/library>

Train Station

How bad is it to get on the wrong train? We've carefully bounded the problem such that the only costs are in terms of time.



BY HARRISON SCHRAMM

Two men are traveling in a foreign city with no map and limited knowledge of the language, and, finished for the day, are trying to get back to their lodgings. They have arrived at a light rail station as a train is boarding. Should they board the train in front of them, not knowing if it is the "right" train, or should they wait for more information? Let's suppose that we have some time – five minutes, say – to analyze this decision.

Before proceeding, let's make some bounding assumptions. First, this is a city light rail, and for simplicity we will assume is similar to the Washington, D.C., Metro. If you miss the train, the next stop is only a few minutes away. Second, let's presume that the trains will be in operation longer than the time scope of the problem, so we are not concerned with being on the last train of the night. We also assume that you are able to change directions without leaving the train system. You took the train earlier in the day, but you didn't necessarily get off at the stop you are currently located. Finally, we assume that you will know with certainty as soon as the train leaves the station if you are headed in the correct direction. If we had no knowledge, we would think guessing will make the "right" choice 50 percent of the time.

How bad is it to get on the wrong train? We've carefully bounded the problem such that the only costs are in terms of time. Consider the paths of two travelers who we call Rob and Jeff, currently at Crystal City wanting to head south, but are unsure if "Huntington" or "Mt. Vernon Square" is the correct direction. At noon, Rob gets on a train headed toward Mt. Vernon Square while Jeff waits for the next train to Huntington. At 12:01, Rob realizes he has chosen the wrong train. At 12:03, he gets off at Pentagon City, crosses over to the other platform, and at 12:05 boards a train headed back toward Crystal City. At 12:10, he arrives back at Crystal City in time to see Jeff get on the train and sit next to him. This is because the whole time Rob was on the "wrong" train, he was headed toward the "right" one. This turns out to be the key to thinking about this problem.

Let's make this story concrete with some mathematics. Let $T_{A \rightarrow B}$ be the transit time between train stations A and B. Let τ be the time until the next train headed from B to A leaves station B. Rob will not be penalized for choosing the "wrong train" so long as

$$T_{A \rightarrow B} < \tau$$

Now we just have to figure out what this expression means to our travelers! Let's proceed by assuming that these times are exponentially distributed, but I'd like to explain the assumption. I'm doing it for two equally important reasons:

1. It makes the mathematics tractable.
2. It is a better model for reality.

I'd like to explain (2) first: We know that the time of train arrivals is continuous and positive, i.e., we cannot get on trains that have already departed the station. This gives us two "easy" distributions to choose from [1]. However, we're assuming that we've ridden on the train once already, and so we may wish to estimate the waiting time based on a single sample. This is a very dodgy business, but we have no choice. If we say that train arrivals are uniformly distributed, then we are implicitly saying that we know the longest time we would ever have to wait. If this were the case, we would know the true upper bound on transit times, and the problem would be much simpler than what is posed here.

With regards to (1), we have to keep the math simple due to the five-minute analysis. There's a nice property of the exponential distribution that is worth remembering, and it is frequently called the "race of the exponentials." If T_A, T_B are exponentially distributed with parameters λ_A, λ_B , then:


$$\Pr\{T_A < T_B\} = \frac{\lambda_A}{\lambda_A + \lambda_B}.$$

We may use (2) to conclude that if the amount of time we waited for our train in the morning is approximately equal to the time between stations (not an unreasonable assumption), then if we get on the train before us, we will have made the correct choice with 75 percent probability.

A more sophisticated approach, beyond the scope of our current discussion, might use the

If your hotel is near the city centre and it is "early" when you are headed toward your hotel, you may presume that the majority of travelers at that time may be headed that way as well, and get on the train if the majority of your fellow platform-standers do as well.

number of persons at the station as an estimator for the time remaining until the next train. If we let N be the number of persons on the platform and T_R be the time remaining until the next train, we would be then interested in finding $E[T_R|N]$.

Bonus: There is another, simpler approach to making this decision that is also worth mentioning. If your hotel is near the city center and it is "early" [2] when you are headed toward your hotel, you may presume that the majority of travelers at that time may be headed that way as well, and get on the train if the majority of your fellow platform-standers do as well. 

Harrison Schramm (harrison.schramm@gmail.com) is a military instructor in the Operations Research Department at the Naval Postgraduate School in Monterey, Calif. He is an INFORMS member.

NOTES

1. This is not to say that we are restricted to these choices; it means that these are the ones that are attractive for this effort.
2. By which we mean "early" to the local custom. Americans may consider 5 p.m. as early, while Europeans may find anything before 11 p.m. as early.

Join the Analytics Section of INFORMS

For more information, visit: <http://www.informs.org/Community/Analytics/Membership> 



THE FRANZ EDELMAN AWARD
Achievement in Operations Research

Call for Entries

A \$15,000 Competition with a \$10,000 First Prize
Application Deadline: October 17, 2012

Key Dates for the Competition

Wednesday, October 17, 2012

Deadline to provide a single pdf document containing a three-page summary (a maximum of 1500 words) of your achievement, and a cover page with a 60-word abstract, and the name, address, phone number, and affiliation of each author. We require that the document be submitted electronically as a pdf file.

Monday, December 17, 2012

Finalists will be selected based on the summaries and the INFORMS/CPMS verification process.

Friday, February 15, 2013

A full written paper in a prescribed format will be due from each finalist along with a publication release and copyright transfer from the client organization, a public relations press kit, and the name of the client management representative who would accept the prize citation.

Monday, April 8, 2013

Each finalist group will give an oral presentation of their work in a special session (which will be recorded) at the INFORMS Conference on Business Analytics and Operations Research in San Antonio, Texas, April 7-9, 2013. Final judging will begin immediately after the presentations, and the results of the competition will be announced at the conference.

informs

CPMS
The Premier Supplier of the World

About the Competition

The purpose of the competition is to bring forward, recognize, and reward outstanding examples of operations research, management science, and advanced analytics in practice. The client organization that uses the winning work receives a prize citation; the authors of the winning work receive a cash award.

Entry Requirements

Send us a document containing a three page summary (a maximum of 1500 words) that describes what you accomplished, in just enough detail to let us judge the appropriateness of your work for the competition. Include a cover page with the title, authors' names and affiliations, and a 60-word abstract of the achievement. We require that the document be submitted electronically as a pdf file. Visit the website www.informs.org/edelmanaward for more information.

All summaries, abstracts, papers, press kits, and presentations must be submitted in English. All papers submitted by finalists become the property of INFORMS. Transmittal of a cash award to a finalist is contingent on the finalist delivering to INFORMS/CPMS, in a specified form, a paper that meets normal publication standards. The first-prize cash award is also contingent on presentation of the work at the CPMS Plenary Session at the INFORMS October 2013 Annual Meeting in Minneapolis, Minnesota. Award winners must satisfy all requirements and standards established for the competition.

Entries should report on a completed practical application, and must describe results that had a significant, verifiable, and preferably quantifiable impact on the performance of the client organization. Finalist work will be published in the January-February 2014 issue of *Interfaces*.

Any work you have done in recent years is eligible, unless it has previously been described by a Franz Edelman Award finalist. Previous publication of the work does not disqualify it. Anyone is eligible for the competition except a member of the judging panel.

E-mail Submissions

Please e-mail your submission to:
pbell@ivey.ca

Peter C. Bell
Chair, 2013 Edelman Award Competition
Richard Ivey School of Business
University of Western Ontario

Watch video of 2012 winner TNT Express accepting the Edelman Award at www.scienceofbetter.org/Edelman.